

Mark A. Hutchison (4639)
Piers R. Tueller (14633)
HUTCHISON & STEFFEN, PLLC
10080 West Alta Drive, Suite 200
Las Vegas, NV 89145
Tel: (702) 385-2500
Fax: (702) 385-2086
mhutchison@hutchlegal.com
ptueller@hutchlegal.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Craig Tann Ltd.
dba Huntington & Ellis A Real Estate Agency
and Urban Nest Realty, LLC*

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

DISTRICT OF NEVADA

NATHANIEL WHALEY,

Case No. 2:24-cv-00105-ART-MDC

Plaintiff,

V.

NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF REALTORS®; LAS VEGAS REALTORS®; NEVADA REALTORS; SIERRA NEVADA REALTORS; INCLINE VILLAGE REALTORS®; ELKO COUNTY REALTORS; MESQUITE REAL ESTATE ASSOCIATION; GREATER LAS VEGAS MLS; NORTHERN NEVADA REGIONAL MLS; JASON MITCHELL GROUP; OPENDOOR BROKERAGE LLC; eXp REALTY; BERKSHIRE HATHAWAY HOMESERVICES NEVADA PROPERTIES; SIMPLY VEGAS; URBAN NEST REALTY; LUXURY HOMES OF LAS VEGAS; HUNTINGTON AND ELLIS, KELLER WILLIAMS SOUTHERN NEVADA; KELLER WILLIAMS VIP; KELLER WILLIAMS REALTY LAS VEGAS; KELLER WILLIAMS REALTY THE MARKETPLACE; ENGELS & VOLKERS LAKE TAHOE; DOUGLAS

**AMENDED JOINT STIPULATED
MOTION¹ AND [PROPOSED]
ORDER TO EXTEND THE STAY
OF ENTIRE CASE THROUGH
FINAL APPROVAL OF
NATIONWIDE SETTLEMENTS**

¹ This paper is styled as a stipulated joint motion pursuant to LR 7-1 rather than a stipulation for the sole reason that some Defendants have yet to be served with process and it is unclear when those named Defendants who are not signatories to this Joint Motion intend to appear in this action. The undersigned are unaware of any objection to the relief requested in this Joint Motion from any non-signatory Defendant.

1 ELLIMAN OF NEVADA; REDFIN
2 HOMESERVICES LLC; REDFIN
3 CORPORATION; DOES I through X; and ROE
CORPORATIONS I through X, inclusive;

4 Defendants.

5 AND CONSOLIDATED CASE

Case No. 2:24-cv-00340-ART-MDC

6 ANGELA BOYKIN, individually and on behalf
7 of all others similarly situated,

8 Plaintiff,

9 v.

10 NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF
11 REALTORS®; UMRO REALTY CORP. d/b/a
The Agency; CHASE INTERNATIONAL,
12 INC.; DICKSON REALTY, INC.; COMPASS,
INC.; eXp WORLD HOLDINGS, INC.; THE
13 REAL ESTATE GUY INC.; BHH
AFFILIATES, LLC; DOUGLAS ELLIMAN
14 INC.; DOUGLAS ELLIMAN REALTY, LLC;
HOMESMART INTERNATIONAL LLC;
CRAIG TANN, LTD d/b/a HUNTINGTON &
15 ELLIS A REAL ESTATE AGENCY; REALTY
ONE GROUP; REALTY ONE GROUP
EMINENCE; REDFIN CORPORATION;
URBAN NEST REALTY, LLC; NEVADA
16 REALTORS; GREATER LAS VEGAS
ASSOCIATION OF REALTORS; GREATER
LAS VEGAS ASSOCIATION OF REALTORS
MULTIPLE LISTING SERVICE, INC.; ELKO
COUNTY REALTORS; INCLINE VILLAGE
17 REALTORS, INC.; SIERRA NEVADA
REALTORS; NORTHERN NEVADA
REGIONAL MULTIPLE LISTING SERVICE,
18 INC.; MESQUITE REAL ESTATE
ASSOCIATION, INC., A NEVADA NON-
PROFIT CORPORATION;

25 Defendants.

26

27

28

1 Plaintiff Nathaniel Whaley and Plaintiff Angela Boykin, on behalf of themselves
 2 and all others similarly situated (individually, the “Whaley Plaintiffs” and the “Boykin
 3 Plaintiffs” collectively, “Plaintiffs”), and the undersigned Defendants,² (together with
 4 Plaintiffs, the “Stipulating Parties”), jointly move to extend the stay of proceedings in this
 5 case through a determination on final approval of the nationwide settlement reached
 6 between the National Association of REALTORS® (“NAR”) and plaintiffs in the Western
 7 District of Missouri and the Northern District of Illinois (ECF No. 66-1). In support of this
 8 joint stipulated motion, the Stipulating Parties provide as follows:

9 1. The Whaley Plaintiffs filed a Class Action Complaint (ECF No. 1) on
 10 January 15, 2024.

11 2. The Whaley Plaintiffs filed a First Amended Class Action Complaint (the
 12 “Amended Complaint”) (ECF No. 6) on January 25, 2024.

13 3. The Boykin Plaintiffs filed a Class Action Complaint on February 16, 2024.

14 4. On March 8, 2024, in the *Whaley* action, Defendant NAR filed a Joint
 15 Stipulated Motion (“*Whaley* Motion”) to Stay Proceedings Pending Determination of the
 16 Motion to Transfer (“MDL Motion”) by the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation (the
 17 “JPML”) (ECF No. 28).

18 5. This Court granted the *Whaley* Motion on March 11, 2024, “stay[ing] the
 19 entire case until the later of (i) 30 days after the [JPML] rules on the pending MDL Motion,
 20 or (ii) 30 days after the date of service or waiver of service of the Amended Complaint on
 21 such Defendant” (ECF No. 31).

22 6. Pursuant to the Court’s Order (ECF No. 56) issued in *Boykin* on March 21,
 23 2024, the *Boykin* action was administratively closed and consolidated with the *Whaley*
 24 action.

25

26

27 ² Defendant Greater Las Vegas Association of REALTORS® Multiple Listing Service
 28 consents to the stay requested herein but have not yet retained local counsel and thus cannot
 sign this motion.

1 7. On March 15, 2024, the plaintiffs in *Burnett v. The National Association of*
 2 *Realtors*, No. 4:19-cv-00332 (W.D. Mo.) (“*Burnett*”), *Moehrl v. The National Association*
 3 *of Realtors*, No. 1:19-cv-01610 (N.D. Ill.) (“*Moehrl*”), *Gibson v. National Association of*
 4 *Realtors*, No. 4:23-cv-00788 (W.D. Mo.) (“*Gibson*”), and *Umpa v. National Association of*
 5 *Realtors*, No. 4:23-cv-00945 (W.D. Mo.) (“*Umpa*”), entered into a settlement agreement
 6 (“NAR Settlement Agreement”), attached hereto as Exhibit A, with Defendant NAR which,
 7 if approved, would constitute a nationwide settlement against the “Released Parties,” as
 8 defined in the NAR Settlement Agreement (Ex. A ¶¶ 17-18).

9 8. On March 21, 2024, Defendant Compass, Inc., entered into a settlement
 10 agreement with the plaintiffs in *Gibson* and *Umpa*, which would constitute a nationwide
 11 settlement that may include similar claims at issue in this case. (*Gibson*, ECF No. 135).

12 9. On March 22, 2024, Defendant HomeSmart International LLC filed a Joint
 13 Consent Motion to Stay Proceedings Pending Determination of Motion to Transfer (the
 14 “MDL Motion”) by the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation (the JPML) as to the
 15 *Boykin* Defendants (the “*Boykin* Motion”) (ECF No. 36).

16 10. On April 2, 2024, this Court granted the *Boykin* Motion, and further
 17 instructed that if the MDL Motion was denied, “the parties shall promptly negotiate and
 18 within 30 (thirty) days file a proposed schedule for this matter, including a schedule for
 19 amended pleadings and a deadline for the defendants to file a responsive pleading or
 20 otherwise respond to the operative Complaint.” (ECF No. 60).

21 11. On April 12, 2024, the JPML denied the MDL Motion (see ECF No. 62).

22 12. On April 19, 2024, the Motion for Preliminary Approval of the NAR
 23 Settlement Agreement (“Preliminary Approval Motion”) as to NAR was filed in *Burnett*
 24 (see *Burnett*, ECF No. 1458).

25 13. On April 22, 2024, the *Burnett* court granted the Preliminary Approval
 26 Motion (*Burnett*, ECF No. 1460).

27

28

1 14. On April 23, 2024, Defendant Realty ONE Group entered into a settlement
 2 agreement with the plaintiffs in *Gibson* and *Umpa*, which, if approved, would constitute a
 3 nationwide settlement that may include similar claims at issue in this case.

4 15. On April 25, 2024, Defendants HomeServices of America, BHH Affiliates
 5 LLC, and HSF Affiliates LLC (collectively “the HomeServices Defendants”) executed a
 6 binding term sheet to settle all claims asserted against the HomeServices Defendants. Under
 7 the terms of this settlement, a Released Party includes the HomeServices Defendants, its
 8 officers, directors, employees, as well as direct or indirect subsidiaries among others. If
 9 approved, this would constitute a nationwide settlement that may include similar claims to
 10 those at issue in this case.

11 16. On April 29, 2024, the Motion for Preliminary Approval of the Realty ONE
 12 Group Settlement Agreement was filed in *Gibson* and *Umpa*, which the Court granted on
 13 April 30, 2024 (see *Gibson*, ECF No. 163).

14 17. On April 29, 2024, Defendant Douglas Elliman filed a Notice of Pending
 15 Settlement in *Gibson* and *Umpa* advising the Court that Douglas Elliman had entered into a
 16 settlement agreement with the plaintiffs in those actions, which would constitute a
 17 nationwide settlement that may include similar claims at issue in this case. (*Gibson*, ECF
 18 No. 157).

19 18. On April 30, 2024, the Gibson³ court granted the Motion for Preliminary
 20 Approval related to Compass’ and Douglas Elliman’s respective settlements with the
 21 *Gibson* and *Umpa* plaintiffs. (*Gibson*, ECF No. 163).

22 19. On June 26, 2024, Defendant Redfin Corporation entered into a settlement
 23 agreement with the *Gibson* Plaintiffs, which would constitute a nationwide settlement that
 24 may include similar claims at issue in this case. On July 15, 2024, the *Gibson* court also
 25 granted the Motion for Preliminary Approval of Redfin’s settlement with the *Gibson*
 26 Plaintiffs.

27
 28 ³ On April 23, 2024, the Court in *Gibson* and *Umpa*, issued an order consolidating the
Umpa action into the *Gibson* action. (*Gibson*, ECF No. 145).

1 20. The NAR Settlement Agreement defines certain categories of entities,
2 including, for example, NAR, REALTOR-Associate® Members, REALTOR® Member
3 Boards, REALTOR® Multiple Listing Services, Non-REALTOR® Multiple Listing
4 Services, and brokerages, and identifies what steps, if any, each category must take to
5 qualify as a “Released Party” pursuant to the NAR Settlement Agreement. (Ex. A ¶ 18).

6 21. Certain entities had to expressly enter into an “opt in” agreement, and
7 comply with certain other terms, to qualify as “Released Parties.” (Ex. A ¶ 18).

8 22. Certain Defendants in the above-captioned litigation represent that they were
9 not required to enter an “opt in” agreement in order to be considered “Released Parties,”
10 (Ex. A. ¶ 18).

11 23. Certain other Defendants in the above-captioned litigation represent that they
12 entered an “opt in” agreement within 60 days from the date the first Motion for Preliminary
13 Approval was filed, and are required to comply with certain other terms, in order to be
14 considered “Released Parties.” (Ex. A ¶ 18(c-f)); *see also id.* ¶¶ 20, 66, 67).

15 24. On May 10, 2024, Defendant NAR filed a joint stipulated motion to stay
16 proceedings as to certain released defendants through final approval of the nationwide
17 settlements and to further stay the entire case for 60 days to allow the various remaining
18 defendants to determine whether they will “opt in” and otherwise comply with the NAR
19 Settlement Agreement, and therefore may also become “Released Parties” (the “Stay
20 Motion”) (ECF No. 66).

21 25. On May 13, 2024, this Court granted the Stay Motion, and further instructed
22 that any additional released parties must “file a status report, including whether the above-
23 captioned litigation should be stayed as to any new Released Parties through final approval
24 of the NAR Settlement Agreement,” no later than 14 days after the expiration of the 60-day
25 stay (ECF No. 67). This stay is scheduled to expire on July 12, 2024.

26 26. On June 18, 2024, the period within which a defendant could enter an “opt
27 in” agreement expired. Prior to that date, Defendants represent to the Court that all of the
28

1 Defendants in this case that were required to opt in to the Settlement Agreement did in fact
 2 opt in.⁴

3 27. On July 12, 2024, Defendant HomeSmart International, LLC
 4 (“HomeSmart”), entered into a settlement agreement with the plaintiffs in *Gibson*, which
 5 would constitute a nationwide settlement that may include similar claims at issue in this
 6 case. (*Gibson*, ECF No. 303).

7 28. On July 15, 2024, the *Gibson* Court granted the Preliminary Approval of
 8 HomeSmart’s settlement. (*Gibson*, ECF No. 348).

9 29. On July 16, 2024, HomeSmart filed a Notice of Settlement and Motion to
 10 Stay Case as to HomeSmart Holdings, Inc. and HomeSmart International, LLC in the
 11 *Gibson* case. (*Gibson*, ECF No. 349).

12 30. On July 16, 2024 the *Gibson* Court granted HomeSmart’s Motion to Stay.
 13 (*Gibson*, ECF No. 351).

14 31. Plaintiffs and Nevada REALTORS®, speaking on behalf of the undersigned
 15 Defendants met and conferred regarding the status of this case in light of this Court’s
 16 directive to “file a status report, including whether the above-captioned litigation should be
 17 stayed as to any new Released Parties through final approval of the NAR Settlement
 18 Agreement and/or propose a litigation and briefing schedule for any responses to the
 19 Complaints and/or amended complaints for any remaining Defendants in the above-
 20 captioned litigation who have not become Released Parties.” (ECF No. 67).

21 32. Given the current litigation landscape, Plaintiffs and the Defendants have
 22 agreed that it is in the interest of judicial efficiency for this Court to modify the current
 23 deadlines set forth in its May 13, 2024, Order (ECF No. 67), and enter an Order to:

24

25

26 ⁴ The Defendants have not provided the *Whaley* or *Boykin* Plaintiffs with the records
 27 substantiating these “opt-ins.” Similarly, the *Whaley* and *Boykin* Plaintiffs are not able to
 28 stipulate that any additional actions to comply with the terms of the NAR Settlement have
 been undertaken by or on behalf of the Defendants and Plaintiffs reserve their rights to file
 a motion to lift the stay at any time should any facts or circumstances come to light that cause
 Defendants’ representations to be in dispute.

1 (1) Extend the stay as to HomeSmart through a decision on final approval of its
2 settlement agreement;
3 (2) Extend the stay as to all remaining Defendants through a decision on final
4 approval of the NAR Settlement Agreement;
5 (3) Order that no later than 14 days after the expiration of the period of appeal
6 from an order with respect to the final approval of the NAR Settlement
7 Agreement, the remaining parties would file a Joint Status Report informing
8 the court of the outcome of the motion for final approval of the NAR
9 Settlement Agreement, and/or propose a litigation and briefing schedule for
10 any responses to the Complaints and/or amended complaints for any
11 remaining Defendants in the above-captioned litigation who have not been
12 released.

13 33. Defendants do not waive any rights to arbitration or other forms of
14 alternative dispute resolution, and expressly reserve and assert, and do not waive, their
15 binding arbitration rights. Defendants reserve the right to file formal motions asserting these
16 rights at each phase of litigation.⁵

17 34. Defendants do not waive any rights to enforce provisions of any applicable
18 agreements including class waiver provisions and/or limitations periods, and expressly
19 reserve and assert, and do not waive, their binding and enforceable rights. Defendants
20 reserve the right to file formal motions asserting these rights at each phase of litigation.

21 35. Plaintiffs and the proposed class expressly reserve all rights available to them
22 in this or any other proceeding, including the right to move to lift the stay provided herein
23 at any time. Plaintiffs' agreement to stay this action as to certain Defendants who may have
24 not opted-in or otherwise settled claims against them in this or related proceedings is solely
25 for purposes of this Action in the interests of judicial economy.

26

27

28 ⁵ Defendants also do not waive and expressly reserve any rights as to any personal
 jurisdiction arguments.

1 DATED this 26th day of July, 2024.

2 BEN'S LAW

3 By: /s/ Stefany "Miley" Tewell

4 Stefany "Miley" Tewell, Bar No. 6144
 Ben Lehavi, Bar No. 14564
 5940 South Rainbow Boulevard
 Las Vegas, NV 89118
 (702) 518-9236

DATED this 26th day of July, 2024.

HUTCHISON & STEFFEN, PLLC

By: /s/ Piers R. Tueller

Mark A. Hutchison, Bar No. 4639
 Piers R. Tueller, Bar No. 14633
 10080 West Alta Drive, Suite 200
 Las Vegas, NV 89145
 (702) 385-2500

7 DATED this 26th day of July, 2024.

8 SCHWARTZ LAW, PLLC

9 By: /s/ Samuel A. Schwartz

10 Samuel A. Schwartz
 601 East Bridger Avenue
 11 Las Vegas, NV 89101
 (702) 802-2207
 12 SASchwartz@nvfirm.com

Attorneys for Defendant Craig Tann
 Ltd. d/b/a Huntington & Ellis A Real
 Estate Agency and Urban Nest Realty,
 LLC

DATED this 26th day of July, 2024.

MCDONALD CARANO LLP

13 By: /s/ Matthew C. Addison

14 Matthew C. Addison, Bar No. 4201
 100 W. Liberty St., 10th Floor
 Reno, NV 89501
 (775) 788-2000

15 DATED this 26th day of July, 2024.

16 ALBRIGHT, STODDARD, WARNICK &
 17 ALBRIGHT

18 Attorney for Defendant Northern
 Nevada Regional Multiple Listing
 Service, Inc.

By: /s/ Daniel R. Ormsby

19 G. Mark Albright, Bar No. 1394
 Daniel R. Ormsby, Bar No. 14595
 20 801 South Rancho Drive, Suite D-4
 Las Vegas, NV 89106
 (702) 384-7111

DATED this 26th day of July, 2024.

FREEMAN MATHIS & GARY, LLP

By: /s/ Scott Eric Anderson

Michael M. Edwards, Bar No. 6281
 770 East Warm Springs Road
 Suite 360
 Las Vegas, NV 89119
 Tel: (725) 258.7360
 Fax: (833) 336.2131
 Michael.Edwards@fmglaw.com

22 Matthew B. George (*pro hac vice*)
 Blair E. Reed (*pro hac vice*)
 23 KAPLAN FOX & KILSHEIMER LLP
 1999 Harrison Street, Suite 1560
 Oakland, CA 94612
 (415) 772-4700

25 Frederic S. Fox (*pro hac vice*)
 Matthew P. McCahill (*pro hac vice*)
 Jeffrey P. Campisi (*pro hac vice*)
 26 KAPLAN FOX & KILSHEIMER LLP
 800 Third Avenue, 38th Floor
 New York, NY 10022
 (212) 687-1980

Scott Eric Anderson*
 Jacob S. Madsen*
 Matthew N. Foree*
 Cameron N. Regnery*

1 Brandon Fox (*pro hac vice*)
2 KAPLAN FOX & KILSHEIMER LLP
1750 North Bayshore Drive
Miami, FL 33132
(914) 924-1038

4 Julie Pettit (*pro hac vice*)
5 David B. Urteago (*pro hac vice*)
THE PETTIT LAW FIRM
2101 Cedar Springs, Suite 1540
6 Dallas, TX 75201
(214) 329-0151

7 Michael K. Hurst (*pro hac vice*)
8 Jessica Cox (*pro hac vice*)
9 Yaman Desai (*pro hac vice*)
LYNN PINKER HURST &
10 SCHWEGMANN, LLP
2100 Ross Avenue, Suite 2700
Dallas, TX 75201
(214) 981-3839

12 *Attorneys for the Boykin Plaintiff and the Proposed Classes*

FREEMAN MATHIS & GARY, LLP
100 Galleria Parkway, Suite 1600
Atlanta, GA 30339
Tel: (770) 818-0000
Fax: (833) 330-3669
scott.anderson@fmglaw.com
jacob.madsen@fmglaw.com
mforee@fmglaw.com
cameron.regnery@fmglaw.com

*Admitted Pro Hac Vice
Counsel for HomeSmart International, LLC

DATED this 26th day of July, 2024.

MCDONALD CARANO LLP

By: /s/ Adam Hosmer-Henner

Adam Hosmer-Henner
100 W. Liberty Street, 10th Floor
Reno, NV 89501
ahosmerhenner@mcdonaldcarano.com

15 *Attorney for Defendant Dickson Realty, Inc.*

DATED this 26th day of July, 2024.

ARMSTRONG TEASDALE LLP

19 By: /s/ Brandon P. Johansson

Brandon P. Johansson, Bar No. 12003
7160 Rafael Rivera Way, Suite 320
Las Vegas, NV 89113
Tel: (702) 678-5070
Fax: (702) 878-9995
bjohansson@atllp.com

24 *Attorney for Defendants eXp World Holdings, Inc. and eXp Realty, LLC*

1 DATED this 26th day of July, 2024.
2
3 FARELLA BRAUN & MARTEL LLP
4
5 By: /s/ Christopher C. Wheeler
6 Christopher C. Wheeler
7 Tim Horgan-Kobelski
8 One Bush Street, Suite 900
9 San Francisco, CA 94104
10 Tel: (415) 954-4400
11 Fax: (415) 954-4480
12 tkobelski@fbm.com
13 cwheeler@fbm.com
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Attorneys for Defendant
Chase International, Inc.

ORDER

Dated this 22nd day of October, 2024.

IT IS SO ORDERED:


15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE